

Understanding the legal construction of justice collaborators through the Bharada Elizer case



Meirza Aulia Chairani ^{a,1}, Trinah Asi Islami ^b Angga Pramodya Pradhana ^{a,2}, Tanawat Sirichai ^c

^a Faculty of Law, Universitas Merdeka Madiun, Madiun, Indonesia

^b Faculty of Law, Universitas Hasyim Asy'ari Tebuireng, Jombang, Indonesia

^c North Chiang Mai University, Nong Kaeo, Amphoe Hang Dong, Chang Wat Chiang Mai, Thailand

* corresponding author: trinahislami@unhasy.ac.id

Article Info

Received: 18 August 2023

Revised: 27 December 2023

Accepted: 28 January 2024

Keywords:

Justice Collaborator;
Bharada Elizer;
Legal Construction

Abstract

The objective of this study is to ascertain Bharada Eliezer's stance on Decision Variety: 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel, which pertains to the position of Justice Collaborator police officers, as well as the Police Code of Ethics Decision concerning Bharada Eliezer's police status. This study employs a normative juridical research methodology, together with conceptual and statutory techniques. Essentially, when an individual unlawfully ends another person's life, it constitutes a violation of human rights and a denial of the right to life, particularly when the perpetrator is a law enforcement officer who continues to serve in the police force. However, in this particular case, the judge and the responsible official overseeing the KKEP hearing must take into account the defendant's status as a justice collaborator, who is feared by irresponsible parties and at risk of abuse. Ensure that all personnel of the National Police receive guidance to prevent them from engaging in actions that contravene laws, regulations, and the ethical standards of the police profession, which could damage the reputation of the police organization or agency. It is necessary to revise the requirements and guidelines for justice collaborators due to certain criminal offenses that pose a threat to the state and involve exceptional crimes. Justice collaborators play a crucial role in clarifying initially ambiguous criminal offenses.

This is an open-access article under the [CC BY-SA 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license



1. Introduction

In Indonesia, the rising prevalence of crime is a highly concerning occurrence. The proliferation of technology has led to a rise in a wide range of crimes, which are no longer limited to conventional methods but instead involve the use of modern technology. Currently employing contemporary technology.¹ The government, society, and law enforcement agencies have made concerted efforts to combat this crime and prevent its

¹ O L van Daalen, J V J van Hoboken, and M Rucz, 'Export Control of Cybersurveillance Items in the New Dual-Use Regulation: The Challenges of Applying Human Rights Logic to Export Control', *Computer Law & Security Review*, 48 (2023), 105789 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2022.105789>>.

occurrence. Mitigate the occurrence of criminal activities. Crime is evolving in terms of its forms, types, reasons, and causal variables.² Law enforcement agencies still face deficiencies in effectively managing matters that fall within their jurisdiction. Cases that remain within the jurisdiction of their organization, unless the case becomes widely known or involves an exceptional offense.³

Law enforcement officials are obligated to fulfill their responsibilities by legal mandates, which include delivering a just verdict in the murder case of Brigadier Josua. However, it is unfortunate that some law enforcement officials are discovered to be engaging in criminal activities. This has resulted in a decline in the reputation of Indonesian law enforcement agencies and their ability to uphold the law in the face of societal changes.⁴ The police, who are frequently emphasized in contemporary discourse, occupy a prominent position in the realm of law enforcement. The police are typically at the forefront of criminal investigations, but, a case can be closed in its early phases due to the discretionary authority held by the police. The unfortunate truth is that certain police officers deviate from the expected ethical standards of their profession, thereby violating the code of ethics that governs their conduct. Police officers who commit crimes or break the police code of ethics shall face sanctions as prescribed by the relevant laws and regulations.⁵

The regulations of Polri encompass the function, role, purpose, position, membership structure, and professional growth outlined in Law No. 2 of 2002, which pertains to the Indonesian National Police (referred to as the Polri Law). The Chief of Police Regulation No. 14 of 2011, also known as the Perkapolri Code of Ethics, sets out the rules and guidelines that members of the Police must follow in their conduct, speech, and actions while performing their duties and exercising their authority. In this scenario, the police officer misuses their authority by using it for ends that are different from the intended objectives of their position.⁶ In state administrative law, "abuse of authority" refers to the misuse of power to carry out actions that go against the public interest or to favor specific individuals or groups. This abuse occurs when the actions, although intended to serve the public interest, deviate from the intended purpose of the authority granted by laws

² Yusi Anggriani and others, 'The Impact of Pharmaceutical Policies on Medicine Procurement Pricing in Indonesia Under the Implementation of Indonesia's Social Health Insurance System', *Value in Health Regional Issues*, 21 (2020), 1–8 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vhri.2019.05.005>>.

³ Sopian Sitepu, 'State Owned Enterprises Finance from the Perspective of State Funds', *Yuridika*, 35.2 (2019), 363 <<https://doi.org/10.20473/ydk.v35i2.16874>>.

⁴ Razananda Skandiva and Beniharmoni Harefa, 'Urgensi Penerapan Foreign Bribery Dalam Konvensi Antikorupsi Di Indonesia', *Integritas: Jurnal Antikorupsi*, 7.2 (2022), 245–62 <<https://doi.org/10.32697/integritas.v7i2.826>>.

⁵ Hendi Yogi Prabowo, 'To Be Corrupt or Not to Be Corrupt: Understanding the Behavioral Side of Corruption in Indonesia', *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, 17.3 (2014), 306–26 <<https://doi.org/10.1108/JMLC-11-2013-0045>>.

⁶ Yul Ernis, 'Diversi Dan Keadilan Restoratif Dalam Penyelesaian Perkara Tindak Pidana Anak Di Indonesia', *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10.2 (2017), 170.

and regulations. Some of these behaviors, due to their positions within the police institution, result in the abuse of authority and misuse of power by these police officials. Lord Acton famously asserted that power has a tendency to corrupt, and when authority is total, corruption becomes inevitable.⁷ This highlights the undeniable existence of corruption, which is shielded by significant power. As a result of this tragedy, there is a prevailing atmosphere of skepticism and unease in society.

An instance of a criminal act that resulted in a decline of public confidence in the police is the case involving Brigadier Josua Hutabarat, Ferdi Sambo from the Profession and Security Division of the Indonesian National Police, Bharada Eliezer, and other individuals. The incident originated from a complaint made by Putri Chandrawati, the wife of Ferdi Sambo, who alleged that she had been subjected to harassment by Brigadier Josua. Consequently, Ferdi Sambo, driven by anger, proceeded to shoot Brigadier Josua.⁸ The shooting was executed by both Ferdi Sambo and Bharada Eliezer, with the latter acting under the direction and command of Ferdi Sambo, who served as their leader. Over time, Brigadier Josua's family became aware of discrepancies surrounding his death and, with the assistance of Advocate Kamarudin Simanjuntak, brought the case to public attention. Eventually, as a result of community pressure, the police, who had no personal involvement in the case, investigated along with government officials. Ultimately, Bharada Eliezer was nominated as a Justice Collaborator and unveiled the truth behind Brigadier Josua's murder.

The confession of Bharada Eliezer exposed the truth behind the assassination of Brigadier Josua, as well as the complicity of police personnel in concealing the crime by tampering with CCTV footage, forensic evidence, guns, and other relevant materials. During the investigation of the case, all individuals implicated, including Ferdi Sambo, Kuat Ma'ruf, Putri Chandrawati, Ricki Rizal, and Bharada Eliezer, underwent trial and were subsequently issued judgments and penalties by the presiding court. Bharada Eliezer was sentenced to a term of imprisonment lasting 1 year and 6 months, as determined by Decision Number 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel.

Bharada Eliezer serves as a Justice Collaborator, acting as a witness who actively assists law enforcement in resolving a particularly challenging case. The crime of premeditated murder orchestrated by a collective is employed to elucidate the individual role played by each culprit in this particular case of premeditated murder. Justice Collaborators are protected under the Witness and Victim Protection Law (Law Number 31 of 2014), which amends the Witnesses and Victims Law (Law Number 13 of 2006). The requirements for Justice Collaborators are outlined in the Supreme Court Circular

⁷ Adrian Walsh, 'Distributive Justice, Equality and the Enhancement of Human Cognition: A Commentary on Fairness and "Cognitive Doping"', *International Journal of Drug Policy*, 95 (2021), 102874 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugpo.2020.102874>>.

⁸ M Zaid, Rabani Merton Halawa, and others, 'Eradicating Public Official Corruption Indonesia: A Revolutionary Paradigm Focusing on State Financial Losses', *Wacana Hukum*, 29.2 (2023), 87–111 <<https://doi.org/10.33061/wh.v29i2.9564>>.

Letter Number 4 of 2011, which addresses the treatment of whistleblowers and witnesses who cooperate in specific criminal cases (referred to as SEMA Justice Collaborators). A Justice Collaborator is someone who is involved in a criminal offense but is not the main perpetrator. They provide testimony as a witness during the legal process, present significant evidence, and disclose the identities of individuals who played a more significant role in the crime. The problem can be characterized as the inquiry into the role of the Justice Collaborator and the judge's considerations in Decision Number 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel. Inquiring about the current police status of Bharada Eliezer. What is the structure of the Commission Hearing on the Status of Police Officer Bharada Eliezer, as outlined in the Construction of Law of the Police Code of Ethics (KKEP)?

2. Research Method

The paper uses normative juridical research, also known as legal research, as its writing methodology.⁹ Legal research involves determining the consistency and conformity of the rule of law with legal norms, as well as assessing whether the norms, in the form of orders or prohibitions, align with legal principles.¹⁰ It also involves examining whether a person's actions are by legal norms (rather than legal rules) or legal principles. The topic in this study is addressed using both a Statute Approach and a Conceptual Approach.¹¹ Primary legal materials refer to authoritative legal documents that possess legal authority. Primary legal resources encompass legislation, official records, and judges' decisions, which are crucial to the process of creating laws.

3. Results and Discussion

The role of the justice collaborator in determining the police status of Bharada Eliezer

Bharada Eliezer is a police officer involved in the murder case of Brigadier Josua. According to Article 29 paragraph (1) of the Police Law, if a police officer is suspected or found guilty of a criminal offense, they are subject to the jurisdiction of the General Court, just like any civilian who commits a crime or offense. This demonstrates that police officers are classified as civilians and are not subjected to military jurisdiction, unlike the Indonesian National Army. Although they are civilians, members of Polri are bound by the Perkapolri Code of Ethics and the regulations outlined in Government Regulation No. 2 of 2003, which governs

⁹ Rian Saputra and others, 'Reform Regulation of Novum in Criminal Judges in an Effort to Provide Legal Certainty', *JILS (Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies)*, 6.2 (2021), 437–82 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v6i2.51371>>.

¹⁰ Rian Saputra, Josef Purwadi Setiodjati, and Jaco Barkhuizen, 'Under-Legislation in Electronic Trials and Renewing Criminal Law Enforcement in Indonesia (Comparison with United States)', *JOURNAL of INDONESIA LEGAL STUDIES*, 8.1 (2023), 243–88 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v8i1.67632>>.

¹¹ M Zaid, M. Musa, and others, 'The Sanctions on Environmental Performances: An Assessment of Indonesia and Brazil Practice', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 3.2 (2023), 236–64 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v3i2.70>>.

disciplinary measures for personnel of the Indonesian National Police (referred to as PP Disiplin). Individuals involved in Chapter 2 of Regulation Number 3 Year 2003 regarding the Execution of Institutional General Technical Courts.¹² The implementation of the Institutional Technical General Justice for Indonesian National Police Members sometimes referred to as the Technical Justicial Regulation for Members of the Indonesian National Police, is usually carried out in compliance with procedural law. Indonesian National Police members are usually subject to criminal prosecution following the procedural law that applies in the ordinary legal system.

Bharada Eliezer had a trial at the South Jakarta District Court, as stated in Decision Number 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel. Bharada Eliezer has been formally accused by the public prosecutor of being legally and convincingly proven to have participated in the crime of unlawfully causing the death of another person, as stated in the Primair Indictment. This crime violates Article 340 in conjunction with Article 55 paragraph (1) to 1 of the Criminal Code. As a result, Bharata Eliezer has been sentenced to a prison term of 12 years. According to Article 340 of the Criminal Code, anyone who intentionally and with prior planning causes the death of another person will be charged with premeditated murder and may face either the death penalty, life imprisonment, or a maximum jail sentence of twenty years.

The concept of premeditation consists of three requirements: (1) a deliberate and composed decision of the individual's will; (2) the presence of an ample amount of time between the formation of the intention and its actual implementation; and (3) the carrying out of the intended action in a tranquil environment. All three components of planning must be satisfied. If any of the prerequisites are not met, the planning element cannot be completed, as the three elements are cumulative. Murder and premeditated murder refer to acts of intentionally causing someone's death, with premeditated murder specifically involving careful planning and consideration.¹³ The distinction between the two lies in the methods, tools, location, timing, and efforts made by the offender to conceal evidence in the case of premeditated murder. Premeditated murder is regarded by the Criminal Code as a crime that egregiously violates the values of fair and civilized mankind.¹⁴ To commit premeditated murder, one must possess a clever intellect or a highly malevolent intent, appropriate instruments and resources, as well as the opportune moment and a compelling reason to incite someone to carry out the act of murder.

Upon examination of Article 340 of the Criminal Code, it is evident that all the necessary elements of the article have been satisfied, leaving little doubt that the individual in question

¹² Nur Annisa Fitri and Arman Arman, 'Perintah Komandan Terhadap Bawahan Dalam Kasus Penembakan Polisi Duren Tiga Perspektif Filsafat Etika Immanuel Kant', *Jurnal Filsafat Indonesia*, 6.3 (2023), 359–65.

¹³ Kathryn M Nowotny, Anastasiia Kuptsevych-Timmer, and Carrie Oser, 'Criminal Justice Contact and Health Service Utilization among Women across Health Care Settings: Analyzing the Role of Arrest', *Women's Health Issues*, 29.2 (2019), 125–34 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.whi.2018.12.005>>.

¹⁴ Nancy Wolff and others, 'Practice Informs the next Generation of Behavioral Health and Criminal Justice Interventions', *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*, 36.1 (2013), 1–10 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlp.2012.11.001>>.

is guilty of premeditated murder. In this scenario, individuals who engage in an action that is forbidden by a legal regulation, and is followed by the imposition of penalties as a form of punishment for those who breach the ban. The components of a criminal offense are categorized as follows: 1) The action must be performed by a human being. 2) The action must be explicitly forbidden and carry the risk of legal consequences. 3) The action must go against established laws. 4) The action must be carried out by an individual who can be legally held responsible. 5) The responsibility for the action must be attributed to the person who committed it. The process of identifying witnesses who collaborate with Justice Collaborators to identify the perpetrator is governed by section 9, letter an of the SEMA Justice Collaborators, which states: "The individual in question must be involved in certain criminal acts as defined in this SEMA, acknowledge their involvement in the crime, not be the primary perpetrator, and provide information as a witness during the legal proceedings." Bharada Eliezer has been suggested by the legal counsel to serve as a Justice Collaborator by Decision Number 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel. Bharada Eliezer applied as a witness who participated in criminal activities and collaborated with the Justice Collaborator. The application included a recommendation from LPSK regarding the awarding of rights and special treatment for witnesses who have cooperated with the Justice Collaborator. The SEMA identifies several grave offenses such as corruption, terrorism, narcotics, money laundering, human trafficking, and other forms of organized crime. These offenses have had significant negative impacts on the stability and security of society, thereby undermining democratic institutions, ethical values, and the principles of justice. Moreover, they pose a threat to sustainable development and the rule of law.¹⁵

Since 1996, the European Union has enacted a decision aimed at combating terrorism and organized crime through the exchange of information with collaborative offenders. Article 1 of Recommendation 9 (2005) by The Collaboration of Justice states the following.¹⁶ A collaborator of justice is defined as an individual who is charged with or convicted of participating in a criminal association, criminal organization, or organized crime offense but chooses to cooperate with law enforcement authorities. This cooperation primarily involves providing information about the criminal association or organization, as well as any criminal offense related to organized crime or other significant offenses.¹⁷

The designation of Justice Collaborator is bestowed upon an executor who demonstrates a willingness to collaborate with law enforcement authorities to disclose pertinent information regarding the case. The fundamental principle underlying the implementation of the Justice

¹⁵ Pieter Agustinus, Mikael Rondo, and Hery Firmansyah, 'Pengaruh Peran Amicus Curiae Terhadap Proses Peradilan Dan Kepastian Hukum', *UNES Law Review*, 6.2 (2023), 4463–68 <<https://doi.org/10.31933/unesrev.v6i2>>.

¹⁶ Matt DeLisi and Michael G Vaughn, 'Foundation for a Temperament-Based Theory of Antisocial Behavior and Criminal Justice System Involvement', *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 42.1 (2014), 10–25 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2013.11.001>>.

¹⁷ Bennett W Fletcher and others, 'Measuring Collaboration and Integration Activities in Criminal Justice and Substance Abuse Treatment Agencies', *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*, 103 (2009), S54–64 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugalcdep.2009.01.001>>.

Collaborator program is the collaboration between law enforcement agencies and non-primary offenders to apprehend the main perpetrators, thereby enabling the dismantling of organized criminal networks.¹⁸ The introduction of the Justice Collaborator in Indonesia serves as a remedy for the challenging issue of law enforcement in the country. Therefore, the Supreme Court serves as a crucial foundation to mobilize and enhance the Indonesian legal system, through the use of innovative practices by the Supreme Court.¹⁹ The establishment of SEMA Justice Collaborators serves as a legislative framework to protect and support Justice Collaborators and whistleblowers who aid in the resolution of criminal cases in Indonesia. Bharada Eliezer has effectively communicated the actual incident, making him a suitable candidate to be recognized as a witness to the perpetrator who collaborates with the Justice Collaborator, as outlined in Article 10 A of the Witness and Victim Protection Law.²⁰

Thus, in specific instances, every participant must take into account the measures to alleviate the situation for the defendant who actively assists in the investigative process, as outlined in the 2003 UNCAC agreement. According to Article 37 paragraph (3) of the Convention, each state party should contemplate the option, in line with the fundamental principles of its domestic law, of granting immunity from legal action to an individual who offers significant assistance in the inquiry or legal proceedings related to an offense established by this convention.²¹ The concept of justice collaboration in Macedonia was derived from the practice of plea-bargaining in the Anglo-American court system. Nevertheless, the execution varies to some extent, particularly with the involvement of legal consultants during the negotiation phase with the prosecutor. According to the 2010 Criminal Procedure Code (CPC) of Macedonia, when negotiating a penalty between a justice collaborator and a prosecutor, it is permissible to just transfer the category of offense, without altering the formal accusation. The concept is precisely delineated as follows.²²

The implementation of the new Criminal Procedure Code in 2010 resulted in the establishment of a contemporary criminal justice system in Macedonia, mostly influenced by the Anglo-American adversarial system. The primary motivations behind the extensive

¹⁸ Craig E Henderson and Faye S Taxman, 'Competing Values among Criminal Justice Administrators: The Importance of Substance Abuse Treatment', *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*, 103 (2009), 57–16 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugalcdep.2008.10.001>>.

¹⁹ Tonia St. Germain and Susan Dewey, 'Justice on Whose Terms? A Critique of International Criminal Justice Responses to Conflict-Related Sexual Violence', *Women's Studies International Forum*, 37 (2013), 36–45 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2013.01.006>>.

²⁰ Keisha April and others, 'Conceptualizing Juvenile Justice Reform: Integrating the Public Health, Social Ecological, and Restorative Justice Models', *Children and Youth Services Review*, 148 (2023), 106887 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2023.106887>>.

²¹ Randikha Prabu Raharja Sasmita, Sigid Suseno, and Patris Yusrian Jaya, 'The Concept of Reasons for Eliminating Corporate Crime in Criminal Law in Indonesia', *Heliyon*, 9.11 (2023), e21602 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e21602>>.

²² Marcos Alan Ferreira and Anna Beatriz Gonçalves, 'Criminal Governance and Systems of Parallel Justice: Practice and Implications in Brazilian Urban Peripheries', *International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice*, 68 (2022), 100519 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlcj.2021.100519>>.

overhaul of the criminal justice system in Macedonia were to enhance efficiency and decrease the duration of criminal procedures.²³ These rules indicate that the Macedonian sentence negotiating process has deviated somewhat from its original US model. This is because it requires the defense lawyer to be present during the entire sentence negotiation process, as mandated by Article 74 of the Criminal Procedure Code (2010). As per Decision Number: 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel, which pertains to the case of Bharada Eliezer, it has been determined that Bharada Eliezer is not the main perpetrator in the killing of Brigadier Josua, despite having cooperated with law enforcement. (1) According to Article 55, Paragraph 1, Number 1 of the Criminal Code, those who conduct, order, or participate in criminal acts are subject to punishment. Bharada Eliezer was involved in a criminal act. The judge's belief and the requirements set forth by the law are closely intertwined in the decision-making process in this circumstance. If the judge's conviction cannot be corroborated by a minimum of two credible sources of evidence, it is considered absent, and if it cannot, two credible sources of evidence are considered invalid.

The judge in Decision Number; 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt. Sel has carefully considered the facts surrounding the death of Brigadier Josua. The case has been shrouded in controversy, causing confusion and distorting the truth and justice. However, Bharada Eliezer, with great honesty, courage, and determination, has come forward to reveal the true events. As a result, Bharada Eliezer deserves recognition as a witness and collaborator with the justice system. It is important to take into account factors that mitigate Bharada Eliezer's involvement, such as his respectful behavior in court, lack of prior convictions, young age, potential for personal growth, genuine remorse, and forgiveness from Brigadier Josua's family.

The judge's decision, based on their conscience, was to impose a sentence of 1 year and 6 months of imprisonment. This decision was influenced by the statement of Reza Indragiri Amriel, a Forensic Psychology Expert and researcher at the ASA Indonesia Institute.²⁴ Amriel stated that if the judge had given a maximum sentence of 2 years of imprisonment, Bharada Eliezer's career in the Police could still have been preserved. According to Police General Listiyo Sigit Prabowo, if a police officer is convicted of a crime and receives a prison sentence over two years, they will be subject to dishonorable discharge (PTDH). Consequently, Bharada Eliezer's eligibility as a police officer, as determined by Decision Number; 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt, which mandates a maximum prison term of less than 2 years, still permits him to pursue a career in law enforcement. The decision regarding this matter must be revisited by the Police Code of Ethics Commission (KKEP).

²³ Roger Smith, 'Criminal Justice and Social Work Practice', in *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences (Second Edition)*, ed. by James D Wright, Second Edi (Oxford: Elsevier, 2015), pp. 208–13 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.28020-3>>.

²⁴ Sarah Dowling and others, 'A Clinical Investigation into the Ability of Subjects with Lung Disease to Provide Breath Specimens Using the EvidenzerIRL Evidential Breath Analyser in Alcohol Intoxicant Driving in Criminal Justice Evidence', *Journal of Forensic and Legal Medicine*, 80 (2021), 102175 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jflm.2021.102175>>.

The case of Bharada Eliezer: Insights into the Legal Construction of Justice Collaborators

The police, as law enforcement officers, are responsible for maintaining security and public order, executing the law, and protecting and serving the Indonesian people.²⁵ Their primary duty is to prevent, eradicate, and address illegal activities. The police, as the primary enforcers of the judicial system, are obligated to fulfill their tasks and exercise their authority as law enforcement officers.²⁶ Nevertheless, certain police personnel engage in the misuse of their power as law enforcement officials by becoming involved in instances of homicide.²⁷ Undoubtedly, this might result in a decline in public confidence in the police's ability to ensure legal certainty and protect the public from the widespread occurrences of murder. The allocation of independent and distinct privileges to handle codes of conduct is also connected to the principles of Institutionalised Organisations. These principles encompass the presence of Regulation and Harmonisation in the organizational structure and police conduct, the implementation of intricate internal regulations, and the utilization of specialized monitoring and evaluation to address violations. Specifically for law enforcement officers who engage in violations of the ethics code.²⁸

When a police officer breaches the code of ethics of their profession, it is tantamount to contravening the law. This is because the breach infringes upon their professional obligations, as well as their responsibilities and power as guardians, servants, and defenders of the community.²⁹ The code of ethics is legally mandated and has been created by The Chief Of The Indonesian Republic Police. Regulation should be established to ensure that disobeying the mandate of the law is considered equivalent to violating the law. Based on the given description, it can be inferred that when a member of Polri breaches the code of ethics of their profession, it is tantamount to violating the law. This violation of the law pertains to their responsibilities and authority as a member of the Police force, specifically in terms of serving and safeguarding the community.³⁰ Bharada Eliezer, one of the individuals involved in the

²⁵ Erika Gebo, 'An Integrated Public Health and Criminal Justice Approach to Gangs: What Can Research Tell Us?', *Preventive Medicine Reports*, 4 (2016), 376–80 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pmedr.2016.07.007>>.

²⁶ Muhamad Khalif Ardi and others, 'The Imperative Is to Restrict Customary Criminal Offenses after Implementing Indonesia ' s New Criminal Code', *Wacana Hukum*, 29.2 (2023), 130–45 <<https://doi.org/10.33061/wh.v29i2.9829>>.

²⁷ Niyang Li, Zhan Wang, and K. Dear, 'Violence against Health Professionals and Facilities in China: Evidence from Criminal Litigation Records', *Journal of Forensic and Legal Medicine*, 67.May (2019), 1–6 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jflm.2019.07.006>>.

²⁸ Ridwan Ridwan, 'Pertanggungjawaban Hukum Pidana Terhadap Pelanggaran Rahasia Medis', *Jurnal Hukum & Pembangunan*, 49.2 (2019), 338 <<https://doi.org/10.21143/jhp.vol49.no2.2007>>.

²⁹ Matthew W Epperson and others, 'Envisioning the next Generation of Behavioral Health and Criminal Justice Interventions', *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*, 37.5 (2014), 427–38 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlp.2014.02.015>>.

³⁰ Stuart Yeh, 'The Electronic Monitoring Paradigm: A Proposal for Transforming Criminal Justice in the USA', *Laws*, 4.1 (2015), 60–81 <<https://doi.org/10.3390/laws4010060>>.

premeditated murder of Brigadier Josua, has been prosecuted and sentenced by the South Jakarta Court to a prison term of 1 year and 6 months. Following the decision of the South Jakarta court, Bharada Eliezer will be summoned by the Police Code of Ethics Commission (referred to as KKEP) for further questioning. The KKEP session took place on Wednesday, February 22, 2023. The session was presided over by Kombes Sakeus Ginting, who served as the Chairperson of the Commission. Kombes Hengky Widjaja and Kombes Imam Thobrini were also present as members.

KKEP determined the outcome of Bharada Eliezer's position in the police force, namely whether he would retain his police status or be subjected to a dishonorable discharge known as PTDH. Following Judge Eliezer's status as a justice collaborator in the murder case of Brigadier Joshua, the South Jakarta District Court, under case number 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel made a ruling. Richard was compelled to obey Sambo's command to shoot Yosua due to the significant difference in rank between Eliezer and Ferdi Sambo. Eliezer was deemed to have misused his official guns, leading to the fatality of one individual, under aggravating circumstances. The KKEP determined the outcome for Bharada Eliezer by allowing him to continue as a member of the Police force, but with a demotion for a duration of one year. The National Police Chief General Listiyo Sigit Prabowo has confirmed that Bharada Eliezer will not be terminated from the police agency upon completing his prison sentence. Instead, he will be reinstated in his vocation as a police officer. Bharada Elizer was administratively penalized for breaching ethical sanctions, specifically for engaging in stated wrongdoing.³¹

Sanctions have been implemented since their decision was made. The demotion decision, which was accepted without appeal by Bharada Eliezer, took effect immediately after it was decided, according to Ahmad Ramadhan, the Head of the Public Information Bureau of the National Police Headquarters. The provisions of the KKEP decision are not congruent with criminal judgments. As stated in Article 12 paragraph (1) of Government Regulation Number 2 of 2003, also known as the Disciplinary Regulations for Members of the Indonesian National Police (referred to as PP Discipline for police members), it is emphasized that the imposition of disciplinary penalties does not absolve individuals from criminal charges. Consequently, Bharada Eliezer will still face legal proceedings in the district court and will not be exempt from criminal penalties.³²

During the KKEP hearing, Bharada Eliezer was found to have violated Article 13 paragraph (1) of Government Regulation Number 1 of 2003, which pertains to the dismissal of members of the Indonesian National Police. This regulation states that the dismissal of police officers must be approved by KKEP. Article 5, paragraph (1), letter o, and/or Article 6, paragraph (2), letter b, and/or Article 8, letters b and c, and/or Article 10, paragraph (1), letter f, and/or

³¹ Aprillia Krisdayanti, 'Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Justice Collaborator Dalam Pengungkapan Tindak Pidana Pembunuhan Berencana', *Jurnal Lex Renaissance*, 7.4 (2022), 803–18 <<https://doi.org/10.20885/jlr.vol7.iss4.art8>>.

³² Abdul Kholiq, 'Amicus Curiae: Position and Role in Issuing Decisions by Judges as an Effort to Achieve Substantive Justice', *Veteran Law Review*, 6.2 (2009), 164–75.

Article 10, paragraph (1), letter a, number 5, of Perkapolri Number 7 of 2022, which pertains to the Professional Code of Ethics and Code of Ethics Commission of the Indonesian National Police (referred to as Perkapolri KEP and KKEP).³³

Article 11, clause a, and Article 12, paragraph (1), clause an of the Government Regulation regarding the termination of Polri members Police officers who engage in illegal activities are discharged with dishonor if they get a prison sentence that is legally binding and cannot be appealed, and if the relevant authorities determine that they cannot continue serving in the police department. This termination is executed following a hearing conducted by the Indonesian National Police Professional Code of Ethics Commission. If you have received a legally binding judgment from the district court and have been sentenced to imprisonment, you may still have the opportunity to defend yourself as determined by authorized officials. In such a case, you will continue to be a member of the Police.³⁴

However, if you are unable to defend yourself, the Police Training and Development Department (PTDH) will discharge you in a dishonorable manner. Bharada Eliezer remains a member of the Police, as confirmed by approved personnel within the Police and taking into account the considerations discussed during the KKEP hearing: 1) The individual accused has not been found guilty of any disciplinary, code of ethics, or criminal violation. 2) The purported offender acknowledges culpability and expresses remorse for the action. 3) The accused individual has become a judicial collaborator or witness to a cooperating offender, where other offenders in the trial at the South Jakarta District Court attempted to conceal the facts through various means, such as tampering with evidence and exploiting their influence. However, the accused individual's honesty, despite facing various risks, has helped uncover the actual events that took place. 4) The accused individual exhibited good manners and collaborated effectively during the trial, resulting in a smooth and transparent proceeding. 5) The accused individual is young, at the age of 24, and yet possesses the potential for a promising future, particularly given their expressed remorse and commitment to refrain from repeating their past crimes. 6) The alleged perpetrator expressed remorse to Brigadier Yosua's family during the criminal trial at the South Jakarta District Court. The alleged perpetrator visited the family, knelt, and apologized for the actions he was compelled to take. He sought forgiveness from Yosua's family. 7) The accused violators were compelled to take all actions under duress, as they lacked the courage to oppose commands from their superiors. 8) The accused individual, who is an enlisted police officer known as Bharada, did not dare to decline the command to shoot Yosua from FS (Ferdy Sambo). This is because FS possesses a far higher rank than the accused individual. 9) By enlisting the assistance of suspicious individuals who are prepared to collaborate and provide truthful information, we

³³ Nugraha Ardi Setiawan, Setiawan Noerdajasakti, and Faizin Sulistio, 'The Weak Role of Prosecutors in Designating Justice Collaborators in Indonesia', *International Journal of Islamic Education, Research and Multiculturalism*, 5.3 (2023), 863–86.

³⁴ Ruth Gracia Imanuela Matruty and Judy Marria Saimima, 'The Death Penalty In The Draft Criminal Code (RKUHP): What Are The Regulations And Mechanisms?', *Jurnal Legalitas*, 16.1 (2023), 111–23 <<https://doi.org/10.33756/jelta.v16i1.19473>>.

aim to uncover the circumstances surrounding the death of Brigadier Yosua.³⁵

The KKEP hearing took into account the fact that Bharada Eliezer remained a member of the police force despite having a Court Decision of less than 2 years. Furthermore, Eliezer became a witness to the perpetrator and cooperated with the Justice Collaborator. The decision of the South Jakarta District Court judge was also considered by the commission, which is responsible for making decisions regarding the KKEP hearing. As a result, Eliezer was allowed to continue serving as a member of the Republic of Indonesia police. Nevertheless, the author identifies deficiencies in Bharada Eliezer's police status, particularly the absence of explicit regulations governing the subsequent implementation of the Justice Collaborator program. Additionally, the author emphasizes the necessity of a rigorous assessment to ascertain an individual's eligibility for participation in the Justice Collaborator program. Irresponsible individuals may exploit this to mitigate their penalties and present themselves as Justice Collaborators. Bharada Eliezer, who took part in the murder, was given a lenient sentence by the judge at the South Jakarta District Court. However, the judge needs to consider Article 28 A of the 1945 Constitution, which states that "everyone has the right to life and the right to defend their life." In this case, the judge should take into account the human rights of Brigadier Josua.³⁶

Torture is universally considered a criminal act, regardless of time or place. Torture refers to the deliberate and severe inflicting of physical or psychological pain and suffering by a public official or someone acting in an official capacity.³⁷ Everywhere I observe, there are clear instances that demonstrate the significant disparity between the commitment and the actual implementation of the global ban on torture, as well as the obligation of each nation to enact laws that criminalize and investigate acts of torture, prosecute or extradite individuals suspected of such crimes, and impose appropriate penalties that accurately reflect the seriousness of the offense.³⁸ In my capacity as the UN Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, I presented a report to the Human Rights Council in March 2023. The report highlighted the concerning and widespread

³⁵ Khairullah Al Mujtaba and Umar Ma, 'Legal Analysis of the Impact of Decisions on Premeditated Murder Criminal Cases on the Judicial Process in Indonesia Now and in the Future (Ferdy Sambo Cases)', 2.2 (2023), 877–903.

³⁶ Endro Tri Susdarwono and Alma Wiranta, 'The Effect of the District Court Judge's Verdict in the Sambo CS Case on the Level of Public Trust in the Criminal Justice System in Indonesia', *Recht Studiosum Law Review*, 2.1 (2023), 40–50 <<https://doi.org/10.32734/rsr.v2i1.11479>>.

³⁷ Thomas Marquenie, 'The Police and Criminal Justice Authorities Directive: Data Protection Standards and Impact on the Legal Framework', *Computer Law & Security Review*, 33.3 (2017), 324–40 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2017.03.009>>.

³⁸ Loraine Gelsthorpe, 'Women and Criminal Justice', in *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences (Second Edition)*, ed. by James D Wright, Second Edi (Oxford: Elsevier, 2015), pp. 616–21 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.28100-2>>.

lack of implementation in the duty to investigate cases of torture.³⁹

Kompolnas is anticipated to transform the militaristic nature of the police force into a more humanistic approach, to enhance the public perception of the police from negative to positive.⁴⁰ The presence of Kompolnas is anticipated as a result of inadequate police oversight, which is overseen by both the Inspectorate of General Supervision (Itwasum) and leadership supervision. Five reasons impede the internal control function, which is as follows: The primary factor is that Itwasda's jurisdiction in overseeing the actions of Polri members is solely limited to gathering information regarding potential violations, which is subsequently forwarded to the appropriate functional unit for further action. It does not possess the authority to prosecute or take direct action. Another factor is that the method does not serve as a comprehensive solution.⁴¹ Complaints are received not only by Itwasda but also by other functional units. The third element is the disproportionate number of subbagdumasan members in the overall tasks being performed. The fourth aspect pertains to the management of peers. According to the observations of other internal supervisors, the task of overseeing and prosecuting colleagues is more challenging compared to prosecuting individuals from outside the organization. The final problem pertains to the lack of comprehension among the general public regarding the complaint procedure.⁴²

The oversight provided by Kompolnas has been ineffective due to its narrow scope of merely receiving and transmitting complaints to the police institution. The outcomes of these suggestions do not require any coerced endeavors. Regarding the enforcement of the code of ethics, Kompolnas is solely involved in overseeing the process of case titles and Commission hearings. They act as spectators and provide direct supervision, but only if they get an invitation from the Police.

4. Conclusion

The Role of Justice Collaborator in Decision Number; 798/Pid.B/2022/PN.Jkt.Sel Regarding the Police Status of Bharada Eliezer. The judge decided on imprisonment for 1 (one) year and 6 (six) months due to several considerations, one of which was Bharada Eliezer as a witness to the perpetrator who cooperated with the Justice Collaborator, submitted as a Justice Collaborator by the legal counsel and approved by the judge. The

³⁹ Eddy Rifai, 'An Analysis of the Death Penalty in Indonesia Criminal Law', *Sriwijaya Law Review*, 1.2 (2017), 190–99 <<https://doi.org/10.28946/slrev.Vol1.Iss2.44.pp191-200>>.

⁴⁰ Ian D Marder, 'Mapping Restorative Justice and Restorative Practices in Criminal Justice in the Republic of Ireland', *International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice*, 70 (2022), 100544 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlcj.2022.100544>>.

⁴¹ Paul Roberts, 'Renegotiating Forensic Cultures: Between Law, Science and Criminal Justice', *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science Part C: Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences*, 44.1 (2013), 47–59 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.shpsc.2012.09.010>>.

⁴² Randi Solhjell, 'How Acts Become Hate Crime: The Police's Documenting of Criminal Cases', *International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice*, 72 (2023), 100574 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlcj.2022.100574>>.

judge's consideration decided the criminal sanction so that Bharada Elizer could still be a member of the police because the imprisonment was under 2 years with consideration of the KKEP hearing authorized officer considering the KKEP hearing whether he could remain a member of the police or be dishonorably discharged PTDH. The construction of law about the Police Code of Ethics Commission (KKEP) Session for Bharada Eliezer's Police Status. After undergoing a general judicial hearing at the South Jakarta District Court with a sentence of 1 (one) year 6 (six) months then continued with the KKEP hearing to determine Bharada Eliezer's police status. The KKEP hearing decided to keep Bharada Eliezer as a member of the police, demotion for 1 (one) year, and apologize to the leadership of the Police, due to considerations such as being a Justice Collaborator, never being convicted, and so on. It does not erase the Banjara criminal sanction decided by the South Jakarta District Court.

5. References

- Agustinus, Pieter, Mikael Rondo, and Hery Firmansyah, 'Pengaruh Peran Amicus Curiae Terhadap Proses Peradilan Dan Kepastian Hukum', *UNES Law Review*, 6.2 (2023), 4463–68 <<https://doi.org/10.31933/unesrev.v6i2>>
- Anggriani, Yusi, Hesty Utami Ramadaniati, Prih Sarnianto, Jenny Pontoan, and Sri Suryawati, 'The Impact of Pharmaceutical Policies on Medicine Procurement Pricing in Indonesia Under the Implementation of Indonesia's Social Health Insurance System', *Value in Health Regional Issues*, 21 (2020), 1–8 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vhri.2019.05.005>>
- April, Keisha, Shannon W Schrader, Toni E Walker, Robert M Francis, Hector Glynn, and Derrick M Gordon, 'Conceptualizing Juvenile Justice Reform: Integrating the Public Health, Social Ecological, and Restorative Justice Models', *Children and Youth Services Review*, 148 (2023), 106887 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2023.106887>>
- Ardi, Muhamad Khalif, Muhammad Ikhsan Kamil, Devi Triasari, and Doris Rahmat, 'The Imperative Is to Restrict Customary Criminal Offenses after Implementing Indonesia ' s New Criminal Code', *Wacana Hukum*, 29.2 (2023), 130–45 <<https://doi.org/10.33061/wh.v29i2.9829>>
- van Daalen, O L, J V J van Hoboken, and M Rucz, 'Export Control of Cybersurveillance Items in the New Dual-Use Regulation: The Challenges of Applying Human Rights Logic to Export Control', *Computer Law & Security Review*, 48 (2023), 105789 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2022.105789>>
- DeLisi, Matt, and Michael G Vaughn, 'Foundation for a Temperament-Based Theory of Antisocial Behavior and Criminal Justice System Involvement', *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 42.1 (2014), 10–25 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2013.11.001>>

- Dowling, Sarah, David Reynolds, Aoife O'Reilly, Geraldine Nolan, Athin Kranidi, Charles G Gallagher, and others, 'A Clinical Investigation into the Ability of Subjects with Lung Disease to Provide Breath Specimens Using the EvidenzerIRL Evidential Breath Analyser in Alcohol Intoxicant Driving in Criminal Justice Evidence', *Journal of Forensic and Legal Medicine*, 80 (2021), 102175 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jflm.2021.102175>>
- Epperson, Matthew W, Nancy Wolff, Robert D Morgan, William H Fisher, B.Christopher Frueh, and Jessica Huening, 'Envisioning the next Generation of Behavioral Health and Criminal Justice Interventions', *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*, 37.5 (2014), 427–38 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlp.2014.02.015>>
- Ernis, Yul, 'Diversi Dan Keadilan Restoratif Dalam Penyelesaian Perkara Tindak Pidana Anak Di Indonesia', *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10.2 (2017), 170
- Ferreira, Marcos Alan, and Anna Beatriz Gonalves, 'Criminal Governance and Systems of Parallel Justice: Practice and Implications in Brazilian Urban Peripheries', *International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice*, 68 (2022), 100519 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlaj.2021.100519>>
- Fitri, Nur Annisa, and Arman Arman, 'Perintah Komandan Terhadap Bawahan Dalam Kasus Penembakan Polisi Duren Tiga Perspektif Filsafat Etika Immanuel Kant', *Jurnal Filsafat Indonesia*, 6.3 (2023), 359–65
- Fletcher, Bennett W, Wayne E K Lehman, Harry K Wexler, Gerald Melnick, Faye S Taxman, and Douglas W Young, 'Measuring Collaboration and Integration Activities in Criminal Justice and Substance Abuse Treatment Agencies', *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*, 103 (2009), S54–64 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugalcdep.2009.01.001>>
- Gebo, Erika, 'An Integrated Public Health and Criminal Justice Approach to Gangs: What Can Research Tell Us?', *Preventive Medicine Reports*, 4 (2016), 376–80 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pmedr.2016.07.007>>
- Gelsthorpe, Loraine, 'Women and Criminal Justice', in *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences (Second Edition)*, ed. by James D Wright, Second Edi (Oxford: Elsevier, 2015), pp. 616–21 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.28100-2>>
- St. Germain, Tonia, and Susan Dewey, 'Justice on Whose Terms? A Critique of International Criminal Justice Responses to Conflict-Related Sexual Violence', *Women's Studies International Forum*, 37 (2013), 36–45 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2013.01.006>>
- Henderson, Craig E, and Faye S Taxman, 'Competing Values among Criminal Justice Administrators: The Importance of Substance Abuse Treatment', *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*, 103 (2009), S7–16

<<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugalcdep.2008.10.001>>

- Kholiq, Abdul, 'Amicus Curiae: Position and Role in Issuing Decisions by Judges as an Effort to Achieve Substantive Justice', *Veteran Law Review*, 6.2 (2009), 164–75
- Krisdayanti, Aprillia, 'Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Justice Collaborator Dalam Pengungkapan Tindak Pidana Pembunuhan Berencana', *Jurnal Lex Renaissance*, 7.4 (2022), 803–18 <<https://doi.org/10.20885/jlr.vol7.iss4.art8>>
- Li, Niyong, Zhan Wang, and K. Dear, 'Violence against Health Professionals and Facilities in China: Evidence from Criminal Litigation Records', *Journal of Forensic and Legal Medicine*, 67.May (2019), 1–6 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jflm.2019.07.006>>
- Marder, Ian D, 'Mapping Restorative Justice and Restorative Practices in Criminal Justice in the Republic of Ireland', *International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice*, 70 (2022), 100544 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlcj.2022.100544>>
- Marquenie, Thomas, 'The Police and Criminal Justice Authorities Directive: Data Protection Standards and Impact on the Legal Framework', *Computer Law & Security Review*, 33.3 (2017), 324–40 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2017.03.009>>
- Matrutty, Ruth Gracia Imanuela, and Judy Marria Saimima, 'The Death Penalty In The Draft Criminal Code (RKUHP): What Are The Regulations And Mechanisms?', *Jurnal Legalitas*, 16.1 (2023), 111–23 <<https://doi.org/10.33756/jelta.v16i1.19473>>
- Mujtaba, Khairullah Al, and Umar Ma, 'Legal Analysis of the Impact of Decisions on Premeditated Murder Criminal Cases on the Judicial Process in Indonesia Now and in the Future (Ferdy Sambo Cases)', 2.2 (2023), 877–903
- Nowotny, Kathryn M, Anastasiia Kuptsevych-Timmer, and Carrie Oser, 'Criminal Justice Contact and Health Service Utilization among Women across Health Care Settings: Analyzing the Role of Arrest', *Women's Health Issues*, 29.2 (2019), 125–34 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.whi.2018.12.005>>
- Ridwan, Ridwan, 'Pertanggungjawaban Hukum Pidana Terhadap Pelanggaran Rahasia Medis', *Jurnal Hukum & Pembangunan*, 49.2 (2019), 338 <<https://doi.org/10.21143/jhp.vol49.no2.2007>>
- Rifai, Eddy, 'An Analysis of the Death Penalty in Indonesia Criminal Law', *Sriwijaya Law Review*, 1.2 (2017), 190–99 <<https://doi.org/10.28946/slrev.Vol1.Iss2.44.pp191-200>>
- Roberts, Paul, 'Renegotiating Forensic Cultures: Between Law, Science and Criminal Justice', *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science Part C: Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences*, 44.1 (2013), 47–59 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.shpsc.2012.09.010>>

- Saputra, Rian, Muhammad Khalif Ardi, Pujiyono Pujiyono, and Sunny Ummul Firdaus, 'Reform Regulation of Novum in Criminal Judges in an Effort to Provide Legal Certainty', *JILS (Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies)*, 6.2 (2021), 437–82 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v6i2.51371>>
- Saputra, Rian, Josef Purwadi Setiodjati, and Jaco Barkhuizen, 'Under-Legislation in Electronic Trials and Renewing Criminal Law Enforcement in Indonesia (Comparison with United States)', *JOURNAL of INDONESIA LEGAL STUDIES*, 8.1 (2023), 243–88 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v8i1.67632>>
- Sasmita, Randikha Prabu Raharja, Sigid Suseno, and Patris Yusrian Jaya, 'The Concept of Reasons for Eliminating Corporate Crime in Criminal Law in Indonesia', *Heliyon*, 9.11 (2023), e21602 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e21602>>
- Setiawan, Nugraha Ardi, Setiawan Noerdajasakti, and Faizin Sulistio, 'The Weak Role of Prosecutors in Designating Justice Collaborators in Indonesia', *International Journal of Islamic Education, Research and Multiculturalism*, 5.3 (2023), 863–86
- Sitepu, Sopian, 'State Owned Enterprises Finance from the Perspective of State Funds', *Yuridika*, 35.2 (2019), 363 <<https://doi.org/10.20473/ydk.v35i2.16874>>
- Skandiva, Razananda, and Beniharmoni Harefa, 'Urgensi Penerapan Foreign Bribery Dalam Konvensi Antikorupsi Di Indonesia', *Integritas : Jurnal Antikorupsi*, 7.2 (2022), 245–62 <<https://doi.org/10.32697/integritas.v7i2.826>>
- Smith, Roger, 'Criminal Justice and Social Work Practice', in *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences (Second Edition)*, ed. by James D Wright, Second Edi (Oxford: Elsevier, 2015), pp. 208–13 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.28020-3>>
- Solhjell, Randi, 'How Acts Become Hate Crime: The Police's Documenting of Criminal Cases', *International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice*, 72 (2023), 100574 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlcrj.2022.100574>>
- Susdarwono, Endro Tri, and Alma Wiranta, 'The Effect of the District Court Judge's Verdict in the Sambo CS Case on the Level of Public Trust in the Criminal Justice System in Indonesia', *Recht Studiosum Law Review*, 2.1 (2023), 40–50 <<https://doi.org/10.32734/rslr.v2i1.11479>>
- Walsh, Adrian, 'Distributive Justice, Equality and the Enhancement of Human Cognition: A Commentary on Fairness and "Cognitive Doping"', *International Journal of Drug Policy*, 95 (2021), 102874 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugpo.2020.102874>>
- Wolff, Nancy, B Christopher Frueh, Jessica Huening, Jing Shi, Matthew W Epperson, Robert Morgan, and others, 'Practice Informs the next Generation of Behavioral Health and Criminal Justice Interventions', *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*, 36.1 (2013),

1-10 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlp.2012.11.001>>

Yeh, Stuart, 'The Electronic Monitoring Paradigm: A Proposal for Transforming Criminal Justice in the USA', *Laws*, 4.1 (2015), 60-81 <<https://doi.org/10.3390/laws4010060>>

Yogi Prabowo, Hendi, 'To Be Corrupt or Not to Be Corrupt: Understanding the Behavioral Side of Corruption in Indonesia', *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, 17.3 (2014), 306-26 <<https://doi.org/10.1108/JMLC-11-2013-0045>>

Zaid, M, Rabani Merton Halawa, Kartika Asmanda, Fadhel Arjuna Adinda, and Lamberton Cait, 'Eradicating Public Official Corruption Indonesia : A Revolutionary Paradigm Focusing on State Financial Losses', *Wacana Hukum*, 29.2 (2023), 87-111 <<https://doi.org/10.33061/wh.v29i2.9564>>

Zaid, M, M. Musa, Fadhel Arjuna Adinda, and Lamberton Cait, 'The Sanctions on Environmental Performances: An Assessment of Indonesia and Brazil Practice', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 3.2 (2023), 236-64 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v3i2.70>>